



# THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

## Edinburgh Research Explorer

### **[Review of] Mark D. Chapman and Jeremy Bonner (eds), *Costly Communion: Ecumenical Initiative and Sacramental Strife in the Anglican Communion***

**Citation for published version:**

Grumett, D 2020, '[Review of] Mark D. Chapman and Jeremy Bonner (eds), *Costly Communion: Ecumenical Initiative and Sacramental Strife in the Anglican Communion*', *Theology*, vol. 123, no. 1, pp. 51-52.  
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0040571X19883536g>

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.1177/0040571X19883536g](https://doi.org/10.1177/0040571X19883536g)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Peer reviewed version

**Published In:**

Theology

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

The final version of this paper has been published in *Theology*, vol. 123, iss. 1., January 2019, by SAGE Publications Ltd, All rights reserved. © David Grumett, 2019. It is available at:  
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/0040571X19883536g>

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Mark D. Chapman and Jeremy Bonner (eds.), *Costly Communion: Ecumenical Initiative and Sacramental Strife in the Anglican Communion*, Anglican-Episcopal Theology and History 4, Brill: Leiden, 2019; 333 pp: 978-90-04-38869-7, €118 (pbk)

In summer 1913 an ecumenical mission conference took place at Kikuyu in Kenya. Held near the capital Nairobi, it brought together 60 Anglicans, Presbyterians, Methodists, Lutherans and other representatives to try to unify Christian mission in East Africa. Given the limited resources and vast field, a unified Church would spread the Gospel more effectively.

This aim was never realised. However, the ensuing controversy, which this volume appraises, is instructive for understanding later ecumenical successes and current intra-Anglican tensions. The Anglo-Catholic bishop Frank Weston of Zanzibar denounced Kikuyu's closing intercommunion because many participants were unconfirmed, even though in nineteenth-century England, as Colin Buchanan shows, confirmation was on the Evangelical agenda but of little interest to Tractarians. Jeff Boldt suggests that the biblical exegesis on which the case for confirmation rested was weak. The leading English Anglo-Catholic bishop, Charles Gore, attacked the undermining of episcopal order, while more sympathetic proposals for England, which Charlotte Methuen reviews, included pulpit exchange, intercommunion, and even the creation of an 'ordinariate' within the Church of England for free church clergy against episcopal ordination.

Mark Chapman suggests that the First World War boosted Anglo-Catholicism, which opposed German liberal theology, had a strong narrative of sacrifice, and promoted episcopacy, which the 1920 Lambeth Conference's 'Appeal to All Christian People' endorsed as fundamental to ecclesial unity. In this new climate the Kikuyu proposals were unlikely to succeed. As Jeremy Bonner outlines, not until 1947, in the aftermath of the Second World War and as Empire collapsed, would the kind of project envisioned at Kikuyu be realised in the formation of the Church of South India.

Many contributors deploy archival sources that offer illuminating detail, such as Ken Farrimond on the competition between different missionary societies. Farrimond also presents the breadth of relationships between the societies and the Anglican dioceses in which they operated, and the considerable power of their London-based secretaries in episcopal appointments and the running of schools and hospitals. On the other hand, a couple of chapters don't even mention Kikuyu nor any issues directly related to it.

Discussing female circumcision, now rightly termed genital mutilation, Kevin Ward reminds readers that extremely important moral issues were at stake in Western engagements with native culture and practice. A shared, well-considered response to these was highly desirable. However, the volume terminates with a chapter by Joseph Galgalo that contests the inclusive Kikuyu mission model, advocating instead the more restrictive GAFCON basis for unity in a doctrinal subscription that exceeds historic credal formularies. Yet if Galgalo is right that the Anglican Churches are 'far more' divided than united (p. 298), the hopes for ecumenical cooperation seem even less. One hundred years ago, Kikuyu recognised that antagonistic relations between Churches, and even with them, harm mission. In our increasingly connected world today, there is even less to commend them.

**David Grumett**  
*University of Edinburgh*